

SR 32 East Corridor Study

Alternatives Comparison Matrix

Comparison Factors	Evaluation Criteria	Bauer-Herold Existing/Future Conditions	Bauer-Herold A1	Bauer-Herold A2	Bauer-Herold A3	Batavia-Half Acre Existing/Future Conditions	Batavia-Half Acre A1	Batavia-Half Acre A2	SR 133-McKeever-Dela Palma Existing/Future Conditions	SR 133-McKeever-Dela Palma A1	SR 133-McKeever-Dela Palma A2	SR 32 Widening A1
Goal #1: Land Use & Infrastructure Needs												
Availability of Developable Land	low/moderate/high	N/A	moderate-north/low-south	high	high-north/low-south	N/A	high	high	N/A	high	moderate	low
Availability of Utilities	yes/no/future connections	N/A	yes	yes	yes	N/A	yes	yes	N/A	future	future	N/A
Land Development Timeframe	short/moderate/long	N/A	long	short to moderate	moderate	N/A	long	long	N/A	long	long	long
Effect on Existing Businesses	positive/negative/neutral	N/A	positive	negative	negative	N/A	neutral	neutral	N/A	neutral	neutral	neutral
Goal #2: Preservation of Right-of-Way												
Amount of Right-of-Way Needed	acres	N/A	27.06	35.8	25.5	N/A	30.7	46.9	N/A	27.5	29.7	17.4
Property Relocations ¹	number	N/A	7	0	1	N/A	0	0	N/A	0	0	8
Parcels Affected	number	N/A	23	19	19	N/A	17	23	N/A	17	12	25
Preservation Opportunity	low/moderate/high	N/A	moderate	moderate	moderate	N/A	high	high	N/A	high	high	high
Goal #3: Compatibility with Local Resources												
Potentially Affected Environmental Resources												
Historic Properties	number	N/A	0	0	0	N/A	0	0	N/A	0	0	0
Archaeological Sites	number	N/A	0	0	0	N/A	0	0	N/A	0	0	0
Hazardous Materials Site	number	N/A	0	0	0	N/A	0	0	N/A	0	0	0
Threatened & Endangered Species	number	N/A	0	0	0	N/A	0	0	N/A	0	0	0
Wetlands	acres	N/A	0.7	0	1.6	N/A	0	0	N/A	14	4	0.02
Surface Waters	acres	N/A	0	1.9	2.9	N/A	0	0	N/A	0	0	0
Waterways	linear feet	N/A	1,225	1,069	1,644	N/A	143	127	N/A	2,861	2,548	898
100-Year Flood Plain	acres	N/A	0	0	0	N/A	0	0	N/A	144	142	0
Floodway	acres	N/A	0	0	0	N/A	0	0	N/A	52	52	0
Farmland/Agricultural Districts	acres	N/A	0	0	0	N/A	16.8	16.8	N/A	0	0	0
Potentially Affected Community Resources												
Public Facilities & Services	number	N/A	0	0	0	N/A	0	0	N/A	0	0	0
Parks & Other Recreational Land/Historic Properties/Section 4(f)	number	N/A	0	0	0	N/A	0	0	N/A	0	0	0
Cemetery Land	number	N/A	0	0	0	N/A	0	0	N/A	0	0	0
Environmental Justice Population	yes/no	N/A	yes	yes	yes	N/A	yes	yes	N/A	yes	yes	yes
Public Support	low/medium/high											
TO BE DETERMINED AFTER PUBLIC MEETING #2 - SEPTEMBER 2008												
Goal #4: Roadway Safety & Efficiency												
Congestion												
2008 LOS	AM/PM	Bauer - D to E/F Herold - C to E/F	No Build Information Only Available			Batavia - A to B/A to B Half-Acre - A to B/A to B	No Build Information Only Available		SR 133 - A/B McKeever C to F/D to E Dela Palma - B/B	No Build Information Only Available		No Build Information Only Available
2030 LOS	AM/PM	Bauer - F/F Herold - F/F	No Build Information Only Available			Batavia - A to B/A to B Half-Acre - B/B	No Build Information Only Available		SR 133 - E to F/F McKeever - F/F Dela Palma - F/F	No Build Information Only Available		No Build Information Only Available
Ability to Improve Congestion Levels on SR 32	low/medium/high	N/A	high	high	high	N/A	no impact	low	N/A	high	high	low
Safety												
2004-2006 Crash Rate per at-grade intersection	crashes per 100 million vehicle miles	Bauer - 1.85 Herold - 0.31	No Build Information Only Available			Not Available	No Build Information Only Available		McKeever - 1.07 Dela Palma - 1.41	No Build Information Only Available		No Build information Only Available
Statewide Crash Statistic for intersections	crashes per 100 million vehicle miles	Bauer - 0.67 Herold - 0.20	No Build Information Only Available			Not Available	No Build Information Only Available		McKeever - 13 Dela Palma - 0.47	No Build Information Only Available		No Build information Only Available
Rate Factor	Statewide Crash Statistic/Comparative Crash Rate	Bauer - 2.76 Herold - 1.55	No Build Information Only Available			Not Available	No Build Information Only Available		McKeever- 8.23 Dela Palma - 3.00	No Build Information Only Available		No Build information Only Available
Ability to Improve safety on SR 32	low/medium/high	low	high	high	high	no impact	no impact	low	low	high	high	low
Connectivity												
Improved Future Travel Time to I-275 (2030) ²	yes/no/no change	N/A	yes; 10 min decrease	yes; 10 min decrease	yes; 10 min decrease	N/A	no change	no change	N/A	yes; 10 min decrease	yes; 10 min decrease	no
East-West Roadway Connections	increase, decrease, no change	N/A	yes	yes	yes	N/A	no change	yes	N/A	yes	yes	no change
North-South Roadway Connections	increase, decrease, no change	N/A	no change	no change	no change	N/A	no change	yes	N/A	yes	yes	no change
Goal #5: Project Financing												
Project Timeline	short/moderate/long	N/A	moderate	short	short	N/A	moderate	moderate	N/A	moderate	moderate	short
ROW Cost Estimate ³	\$	N/A	\$11,293,000	\$1,798,000	\$1,881,000	N/A	\$980,000	\$1,160,000	N/A	\$1,156,000	\$960,000	\$2,534,000
Construction Cost Estimate ⁴	\$	N/A	\$14,508,000	\$9,555,000	\$11,115,000	N/A	\$2,509,000	\$8,996,000	N/A	\$8,983,000	\$9,009,000	\$19,695,000
Estimated Project Cost ⁵	\$	N/A	\$36,652,000	\$18,505,000	\$21,306,000	N/A	\$5,365,000	\$16,885,000	N/A	\$16,860,000	\$16,707,000	\$36,959,000

1 All Property Relocations/total takes are commercial properties
2 Travel Time savings equal improvement over the No-Build or Do Nothing Scenario
3 ROW Costs = Auditor's Value ROW Costs + Appraisal/Aquisition Costs + Damage Costs + Inflation Costs + Contingency
4 Construction Cost Estimate includes construction cost only in 2008 dollars including constructible risk
5 Estimated Project Costs = 2008 construction costs + 30% Design Contingency + 64.8% 2017 inflation costs + ROW Costs + Design Costs